City of Dallas

MAYOR’S TASK FORCE ON CONFEDERATE MONUMENTS
MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, August 31, 2017
6 p.m.
Dallas City Hall, Council Chambers
1500 Marilla Street, 6EN
Dallas, Texas 75201

PRESENT: [18]

ABSENT: [2]
Coymelle Murchison, Larry Schoenbrun

CITY STAFF PRESENT:
Larry Casto (City Attorney), Joey Zapata (Assistant City Manager), Tammy Palomeno (CAO), Juan Garcia (CMO), Jennifer Scripps (OCA), David Fisher (OCA), Clifton Gillespie (OCA), Kay Kallos (OCA), Lynn Rushton (OCA), John Spriggins (OCA), Willis Winters (PKR), Peter Bratt (PKR), David Cossum (DEV), Mark Doty (DEV), Neva Dean (DEV), Patricia Blasquez, (MCC)

I. Call To Order
A quorum of the task force members being present, the Chair called the meeting to order at 6:04 p.m.

II. Mayor’s Welcome
Mayor Michael S. Rawlings made opening remarks to the task force.

III. Introductions
Task force members each made introductory remarks.

IV. Acknowledgement of Letter
The Chair acknowledged the letter to Mayor Rawlings dated August 17, 2017, from State Senator Royce West, State Representative Helen Giddings, State Representative Roberto Alonzo, State Representative Rafael Anchia, and State Representative Toni Rose regarding removal of confederate monuments
[EXHIBIT A]

V. Briefings:

a. Legal Framework and Task Force Procedures
   Larry Casto, City Attorney

b. Public Art Overview and Policies [EXHIBIT B]
   Jennifer Scripps, Director, Office of Cultural Affairs
   Kay Kallos, Public Art Program Manager, Office of Cultural Affairs
   John Spriggins, South Dallas Cultural Center Manager, Office of Cultural Affairs

c. Historic Preservation and Landmarks [EXHIBIT C]
   Mark Doty, Chief Planner-Historic Preservation, Department of Sustainable Development & Construction

d. Naming of Parks [EXHIBIT D]
   Willis Winters, Director, Park & Recreation Department

e. Naming of Streets [EXHIBIT E]
   Neva Dean, Assistant Director, Department of Sustainable Development & Construction

VI. Discussion of Task Force Process, Goals, and Planning

VII. Adjournment

After all business properly brought before the task force had been considered, the task force adjourned at 8:56 p.m.

Frances Cudjoie Waters, Chair

ATTEST:

Clifton Gillespie, Office of Cultural Affairs

Date Approved 9/7/2017
Dear Mayor Rawlings:

It is unfortunate that once again, we find ourselves in heated debate regarding monuments honoring Texans and others who seceded from the federal government to become members of the "Confederated Union."

Some argue that these monuments to Confederate soldiers do not honor their role in succession but rather, their bravery and sacrifice in defending their homeland.

We believe, however, that any glamourized references to a formerly legal system of dehumanization, brutality, rape, murder and subjugation based on racial hatred are offensive, hurtful, and repugnant. They now stand inappropriate and should be removed from public display and not memorialized as heroic.

The horror of the Charleston, South Carolina murders two years ago and the recent White Supremacist Rally and subsequent deaths bring light to the immediate necessity that the monuments that honor our horrid past and fuel hatred today must be removed.

The time has come for these relics of the past to be removed from public places. They can serve a purpose as a reminder of historical fact, but none should be a symbol for which young or future Americans should
aspire. We propose that solutions are created for display in context of their role as part of a past that should not be repeated in days to come.

Towards that end, we have been informed that you will be creating a task force to bring back recommendations to the council in 90 days. We are supportive of this action and look forward to receiving the recommendations.

Respectfully submitted by,

Royce West
State Senator

Helen Giddings
State Representative

Roberto Alonzo
State Representative

Rafael Anchia
State Representative

Toni Rose
State Representative

RW:lb:hbs
Office of Cultural Affairs

Presentation to the Task Force on Confederate Monuments

August 31, 2017

Jennifer Scripps, Director
Kay Kallos, Public Art Program Manager
John Spriggins, South Dallas Cultural Center Manager
Purpose

- Public Art in Dallas
- What is being done nationally
- Confederate Monuments in Dallas
- Additional Representations of the Confederacy in Dallas
- Process for Removal of City-owned Artwork
- Questions
Origins of Public Art in Dallas

Before 1989

• Historic murals, bas reliefs and sculptures at Fair Park.
• Monuments and Artwork donated to the City became part of the Public Art Collection in 1989.

  • *Confederate Monument* by Frank Teich, 1896-7
  • *Robert E. Lee and the Confederate Soldier*, Alexander Phimister Proctor, 1936
  • *The Dallas Piece* at City Hall Plaza by Henry Moore, 1978 (at right)
  • *Floating Sculpture* by Marta Pan, 1979 (at right)

Marta Pan, *Floating Sculpture* (1979), Dallas City Hall
Public Art Program Established 1989

• 1987-88
  • Public Art Plan developed by a 30-member citizen committee
  • Citizen input received

• 1988
  • Public Art Ordinance adopted (Dallas City Code Chapter 2 Article X) (Resolution # 88-2968)

• Public Art Ordinance can be found at
  • www.dallasculture.org
Monuments are common in America and have been supported, commissioned, and installed since the 1800s.

Address our desire to memorialize individuals, groups and events of significance.
- Washington Monument
- Jefferson Memorial
- Vietnam Veterans Memorial
- JFK Memorial
- MLK Memorial
- Rosa Parks Plaza in Dallas

Make a public statement about the social and historical viewpoints of the individuals and groups who commission them.

Intentionally built to last – expecting that their significance will endure for a long time.

While they are made by artists, they are not independent artistic expressions.

The Confederate Monuments were donations to the City of Dallas before a public art process for the review of donations existed.
What is taking place nationally

**States, Cities, and Universities**

- **Removed/Storage**: 16
- **Relocated Monuments**: 8
- **City Task Forces to study**: 5
- **Changes made to monuments**: 3
- **Monuments Covered**: 2
- **Renamed**: 1
- **No Action**: 0
## Confederate Monuments in Dallas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title of Work</th>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Confederate Monument</td>
<td>Frank Teich</td>
<td>1896-97</td>
<td>Pioneer Cemetery, Young Street</td>
<td>Donated by the Daughters of the Confederacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Has Dallas Landmark Status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1897 installed at Old City Park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Relocated 1961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert E. Lee and the Confederate Soldier</td>
<td>Alexander P. Proctor</td>
<td>1936</td>
<td>Lee Park, 3400 Turtle Creek Blvd</td>
<td>Donated by the Southern Memorial Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>On Park Property</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Confederate Monuments in Dallas

Frank Teich, *Confederate Monument*, 1896-97

### Additional Representations of the Confederacy in Fair Park

Artwork at Fair Park is under City of Dallas Landmark, State Antiquities Landmark, and National Historic Landmark protection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Artist</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female Figure as the Confederacy</td>
<td>Lawrence Tenney Stevens</td>
<td>1936</td>
<td>Fair Park, Esplanade</td>
<td>One of six figures depicting Texas History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roundel depicting the Confederate Flag with 7 stars</td>
<td>Not known</td>
<td>1936</td>
<td>Fair Park, Esplanade</td>
<td>One of six roundels depicting the flags of Texas History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Seal of Texas</td>
<td>Joseph Renie</td>
<td>1936</td>
<td>Hall of State, Far end of the Great Hall</td>
<td>Female figures representing the six historic republics of Texas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History of Texas Mural</td>
<td>Eugene Savage, Reveau Basseit, James Buchanan Winn</td>
<td>1936</td>
<td>Hall of State, Great Hall</td>
<td>Each of the six flags of Texas is included in the mural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bronze Lanterns</td>
<td>Not known</td>
<td>1936</td>
<td>Hall of State, Entrance</td>
<td>Figures of soldiers representing the 6 historic republics of Texas</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Additional Representations of the Confederacy in Fair Park

Lawrence Tenney Stevens, *The Confederacy*, 1936

*Confederate Roundel*, 1936
Additional Representations of the Confederacy in Fair Park

Joseph Renie, *The Great Seal of Texas, 1936*

Detail of the Confederacy figure – right
Additional Representations of the Confederacy in Fair Park

The Confederate Soldier, 1936

Detail of the State of Texas History Mural with flags
Texas History Mural in the Great Hall
Public Art Collection Today
290 works

- 168 works in the public art collection were donated to the City
- 149 of the works in the public art collection were created before 1990
- Donations of artwork continue today
- 122 works have been commissioned since 1989 using the public art process
- Only 2 works have been removed from the collection using the public art process
The Public Art Committee shall act as the panel or name an independent qualified panel to review works designated for consideration for deaccessioning.

The Public Art Committee may recommend any of the following courses of action as a result of deaccessioning review:

- Relocate artwork.
- Sell or trade artwork (secure professional appraisal and advertise sale; seek competitive bids; dispose of work via surplus property procedures).
- Remove work from display and store.
- If no other alternative is evident, remove and permanently dispose of artwork. Disposal could include return to the artist, or donation to charity or other local government entity.
History of Removal of Artwork

Two works of art have been removed since the beginning of the Office of Cultural Affairs in 1989

*Family Group*, 1976
Artist Susan Pogzeba Phipps

- Removed in 1991
- Work was damaged beyond repair

*Wildlife Water Theater*, 2001
Artists Frances Bagley and Tom Orr

- Removed in 2015
- Maintenance issues and deterioration of the work installed in White Rock Lake
Questions
Sustainable Development and Construction

Presentation to the Task Force on Confederate Monuments

August 31, 2017

Mark Doty, Chief Planner
Historic Preservation
City of Dallas
Historic Designations

- Pioneer Cemetery is a City of Dallas landmark district.

- Pioneer Cemetery was designated a City of Dallas landmark in May 2002 (Historic overlay No. 114)
Historic Designations

• Fair Park was designated a City of Dallas landmark in 1987 (Historic overlay No. 33)

• Fair Park is a City of Dallas landmark district, State Antiquities Landmark, and a National Historic Landmark.
Pioneer Cemetery

- Site was on the southern edge of Dallas when the first burial occurred in 1840’s.
- Originally comprised four separate cemeteries: Masonic, Odd Fellows, Jewish, and the City cemetery.
- Last body interned in 1921.
- Early Dallas citizens buried in Pioneer Cemetery include several mayors, judges, and other civic leaders.
Pioneer Cemetery

- Confederate monument was moved to Pioneer Cemetery in 1961 when construction of R.L. Thornton Freeway necessitated its move from Old City Park.
Certificate of Appropriateness (CA)

• A permit to allow alterations to an existing structure or site or construction of a structure that is located in a designated Landmark district
Certificate of Appropriateness (CA)

- Typically, CA’s are only required for exterior work to structures or the site, however because Fair Park preservation criteria specifically calls out ‘historic interiors,’ Landmark Commission also has purview over those spaces as well.
Certificate of Demolition (CD)

- A permit to allow alterations, construction, or demolition of a structure or site that is located in a designated Landmark district
- One of five standards must be met for Landmark Commission to approved a Certificate for Demolition.
Certificate of Demolition (CD)

Application can be made under at least one of these standards:

- Replace with more appropriate/compatible structure
- No economically viable use
- Imminent threat to public health and safety
- Non-contributing to historic overlay
- Court ordered demolition (usually applied for by City Attorney’s Office)
Pioneer Cemetery

Since the Confederate Monument is located within the historic district boundary of Pioneer Cemetery, a Certificate for Demolition and Removal will need to be submitted for Landmark Commission review.
CA or CD review process

Certificate of Appropriateness Application (CA) submitted

Task Force Review

Staff Review

Staff and Task Force recommendations mailed to applicant

LANDMARK COMMISSION HEARING (Final Decision)

DENIED
Applicant can resubmit or appeal to CPC

APPROVED
CA/CD emailed 10 days AFTER hearing
State Antiquities Landmark (SAL)

- State Antiquities Landmarks (SAL) are designated by the Texas Historical Commission (THC) and receive legal protection under the Antiquities Code of Texas.
- SAL designation does not mean that sites or buildings cannot be altered or destroyed.
- The land-owning agency must consult with the THC about such proposed actions through the permit process, and the THC will determine whether the work will be allowed.
- Fair Park became an SAL in 1984.
National Historic Landmarks

• National Historic Landmarks (NHL) are nationally significant historic places designated by the Secretary of the Interior because they possess exceptional value or quality in illustrating or interpreting the heritage of the United States.
• The 2,500 properties designated as National Historic Landmarks tell stories that are of importance to the history of the entire nation, not just local communities or states. These properties possess a high, not simply good, level of historic integrity.
• Fair Park was designated a National Historic Landmark in 1986.
National Historic Landmarks

• This recognition does not prevent changes being made to the property that can completely alter its character.
• When a designated property is altered so that it has lost its ability to convey its national significance, the withdrawal of its NHL designation must be considered.
• The National Historic Landmark designation of a property can be considered for withdrawal either at the request of the owner or on the initiative of the Secretary of the Interior.
Park Naming Policy
Purpose

• Provide history and background on parks with Confederate names
  • Robert E. Lee Park
  • Confederate Cemetery

• Provide overview of Park and Recreation Department’s Naming Policy
Robert E. Lee Park

- Land purchased by Park Board in 1909
  - 17.5 acres purchased from the Dallas Street Railway Company for $38,000
- Named Oak Lawn Park
- Park became component of Turtle Creek Greenbelt
Robert E. Lee Park

- In 1928 Dallas Southern Memorial Association (DSMA) proposed placement of equestrian statue of Robert E. Lee at an unidentified Dallas park
  - Raised $50,000
- May 5, 1936
  - Park Board approved location of statue at Oak Lawn Park
  - Renamed Robert E. Lee Park
  - Also considered Dealey Plaza and Swiss Avenue as potential locations
  - Park Board appropriated $3,700 for sculpture base
    - Partially funded by Works Project Administration (WPA) grant
    - Designed by Dallas architect Mark Lemmon
    - Constructed by WPA
Robert E. Lee Park

- Robert E. Lee Monument unveiled June 12, 1936
  - Dedicated by President Franklin D. Roosevelt
- Arlington Hall
  - Groundbreaking ceremony on January 19, 1938
  - Designed by Mark Lemmon
    - Two-thirds-size replica of Arlington House, Custis-Lee family home located in Arlington National Cemetery
    - Cost: $29,648
    - Funded in part by WPA Park Improvement Program
  - Dedicated October 24, 1939
Robert E. Lee Park

- 1991 – Lee Park and Arlington Hall designated with a Texas historical marker
- 1992 (August 6) – Park Board voted 14-0 to deny renaming of Lee Park and removal of the Robert E. Lee statue
- 1995 – Lee Park/Arlington Hall Conservancy (LP/AHC) formed
  - Executed development and operation agreement with Park and Recreation Department in 1998
  - Public-private effort between the City of Dallas and LP/AHC to rehab and expand Arlington Hall
    - Completed in December 2003
    - LP/AHC raised $2,150,000
    - City provided $500,000 in 1998 bond funds
Confederate Cemetery

- In 1901, Dallas County set aside 0.75 acres in South Dallas for the burial of indigent ex-Confederate soldiers
- Land transferred from Dallas County to City in 1936
- Maintained and operated by Park and Recreation Department since 1936
Park Naming Policy

• Park Board created in 1905 by City Council to have jurisdiction over public parks (*City Charter Chapter XVII*)
• Park Board evaluated the then-current Park Naming Policy in 2008
• Current Park Naming Policy was adopted by the Board on February 19, 2009
• Board authorized a moratorium on naming parks pending a future review of the policy in April 2011
• Park Board began review and revision process of current policy in May 2017
Park Naming Policy

• Naming duration
  • Duration of an official name shall be deemed, in all cases, to be 40 years unless a shorter or longer period is specifically stated in the Board’s naming or renaming decision

• Renaming can apply if:
  • Park has a placeholder name
  • Term of the official name expires
  • Current official name is “dishonored”
Park Naming Policy

• 137 parks officially named (396 parks in system)
• Park Naming Policy does not prevent City Council from naming parks
  • Practice has generally been that the Park and Recreation Board names parks on park land
  • During the 1980s, the City Council affirmed the Park Board’s naming of six parks
• Robert E. Lee Park officially named May 5, 1936
• Confederate Cemetery has placeholder name
Questions
Street Naming and Name Change Process

Confederate Monument Task Force

August 31, 2017

Neva Dean
Sustainable Development and Construction Assistant Director

City of Dallas
Overview

• Review confirmed street names associated with the Confederacy
• Provide an overview of how streets are traditionally named
• Review process and timeline for street name changes
• Identify associated costs
## Confirmed Street Names Associated with the Confederacy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Name</th>
<th>Named for</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beauregard</td>
<td>Pierre G.T. Beauregard</td>
<td>Confederate General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cabell</td>
<td>William L. Cabell</td>
<td>Confederate General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clark</td>
<td>Edward Clark</td>
<td>Former Governor of Texas and Confederate Colonel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gano</td>
<td>Richard Montgomery Gano</td>
<td>Confederate Brigadier General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaston</td>
<td>William Henry Gaston</td>
<td>Confederate Captain; purported model for Confederate Memorial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>John Jay Good</td>
<td>Confederate Captain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lee Parkway</td>
<td>Robert E. Lee</td>
<td>Confederate General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lemmon</td>
<td>William H. Lemmon</td>
<td>Confederate Captain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Traditional Street Naming Process

• Today, streets are typically named through
  • The platting process
  • The creation of new streets and thoroughfares
• Streets may also be named through City Council resolutions
• In the past, streets were re-named by the Board of Commissioners
Who Can Initiate a Street Name Change?

- An owner of property abutting the street
  - Petition is required indicating that at least 51% of the owners of all lots abutting the street favor the name change

- Director of Sustainable Development and Construction, if necessary to address public safety concerns

- A City Council Member, with concurrence of two other City Council Members

- City Plan Commission, by majority vote
Standards for Street Name Changes

• Proposed street name may not be similar to an existing street name
• Street name that uniquely identifies a particular tract, tenant, or product name is prohibited
• Street name may be based upon physical, political, or historic features
• Name thematically related to the name of subdivision may be given to a street within the subdivision
Historic Street Names

• Historic street names may not be changed, without a three-fourths vote by City Council

• A historic street name commemorates:
  • A person who significantly contributed to the cultural, economic, social, religious, or political heritage of the city
  • A site or area where there occurred historic events which significantly contributed to the cultural, economic, social, religious, or political heritage of the city
  • A person or family founding or traditionally associated with the area where the street is located
One Name for Same Roadway Unless:

- If a minor roadway deviates from its predominant course at a 90 degree angle for a distance of more than 300 feet
- If two segments of a minor roadway are separated by an intervening land use that prohibits vehicular passage
- If street is interrupted and offsets more than 150 feet at cross street
Timeline and Review Process

Receive complete application

Within 10 working days

Application sent to different City departments and agencies outside City for comments

Comments received

Subdivision Administrator sets date for public hearing before Subdivision Review Committee (SRC)

Before 15 days prior to hearing

Notice advertised, written notice mailed, and notification signs posted along the street

Before 30 days prior to hearing

Subdivision Administrator sets date for public hearing before City Plan Commission (CPC)

Public Hearing (SRC)

Subdivision Administrator sets date for public hearing before City Council

If CPC recommends denial, the action is final unless applicant appeals to City Council within 10 days of the CPC hearing

Public Hearing (CPC)

Public Hearing (City Council)

Notice advertised, written notice mailed, and notification signs posted along the street

Before 15 days prior to hearing
Effective Date and Notification

- The street name change is effective
  - Either 60 days after City Council approval or
  - A later date specified in the ordinance
- Written notice is provided to City departments and other entities (such as electrical, gas, and telephone providers) of the new street name.
- Written notice is provided to property owners abutting the street of the Council decision
Fees for a Street Name Change

- Application Fees
  - Paid to Director of Development Services
  - Before Application is processed

- New Street Identification Signs
  - Paid to Director of Mobility & Streets Services
  - Within 60 days of City Council approval

- Change of Official Address Records
  - Paid to Building Official
Fees for a Street Name Change Contd.

Application Fees

- $750.00
  - If the street is less than one-fourth mile
- $1050.00
  - If the street is less than one-half mile but more than or equal to one-fourth mile
- $1350.00
  - If the street is less than one mile but more than or equal to one-half mile
- $1350.00 for first mile plus $300.00 for each additional one-fourth mile
  - If the street is more than or equal to one mile
Fees for a Street Name Change Contd.

Street Identification Sign Fees

$113.00
For each blade to be replaced

$233.00
For each mast arm blade to be replaced

To be determined based upon Texas Department of Transportation cost calculation at the time of installation

For Texas Department of Transportation signs to be replaced